International Accreditation and Student Learning Results: the Country Case of Mongolia

By William S. Parrott and Alimaa Jamiyansuren
International Accreditation and Student Learning Results: the Country Case of Mongolia

A case study of how Mongolia worked on improving student learning outcomes with the use of Peregrine’s assessment services.
Mongolia: Background

Location: Northern/Central Asia
Territory: 1.56 million square kilometers (US 9.83 mln km2)
           1,500 miles West to East, 800 miles North to South

Population: 2.8 Million
Neighbors: Russia to North, China to South
Facts: 2nd oldest communist nation
       2nd largest landlocked country

1990: Collapse of socialism/communism

Political system: Parliamentary Democracy, “Ikh Khural”
Economy: Open, free market-based
Mongolia: *Higher Education*

- Private enterprise: was first allowed to register and operate in 1990 (Seruuleg U., 1990/1992) and 1991 (Otgontenger U.)
- Number of institutions: mushroom (about 400 at peak)
- Types of institutions: degree and non-degree offering, technical and professional, foreign language programs
- Sources of funding: public, private, foreign investment
- Types of ownership: public, private, public and private partnership
Mongolia: *Need for Accreditation*

- Extremely competitive higher education market landscape
  - 99 institutions of higher education for 2.8 mln population

- Mongolian citizens started traveling abroad
  - Post-graduate and undergraduate studies abroad
  - Employment abroad/locally by global and multi-national companies

- Foreign institution’s requirements:
  - Posses a degree from a recognized and/or accredited institution

- Employment based on person’s profession/education:
  - Posses professional degree from a reputable institution - recognized and/or accredited by a national/regional accreditor
Mongolia: Need for Accreditation

• Government administration of student loans
  – Students required to attend institutions that meet quality standards and requirements

• Accountability for public funding of institutions
  – Tax payers’ money needed to be allocated to institutions that are fiscally responsible, administer internal audits, and provide quality education

• Internal and external student movement and exchange
  – Academic credit transfer and recognition requirements

• Students face global education market: study anywhere in the world
  – Mongolian institutions needed to become competitive not only locally but also in the world market
Mongolia: *Accreditation system was needed to address all issues*

- **1995-1998:** Established legal framework in Ikh Khural, the Parliament
  - Who should conduct accreditation
  - Structure and type of accrediting entity
  - Funding and costs

- **1998:** Founded the Mongolian National Council for Education Accreditation, MNCEA

- **1998-2003:** Initial institutional accreditation by MNCEA

- **2003-2009:** Secondary accreditation and programmatic accreditation

- **2009- present:** Secondary institutional and programmatic accreditation
Accreditation and Assessment

• MNCEA recognized need for not only accreditation but also assessment of student learning outcomes
  – Assessment as a concept did not exist in Mongolia
  – Assessment Tools did not exist in Mongolia

• MNCEA conducted initial research into Assessment with ADB funding
  – Asian experiences: PASCU of Philippines, ONESCO of Thailand and Australian International Accreditation Agency (National Accreditation Scheme)
  – European experiences: EQUIS and INQAAHE
  – American experiences: CHEA and regional accreditation bodies.

• MNCEA decided to select the American system because the American Credit and the Evaluation systems were being implemented in the Mongolian educational system.
MNCEA: **Assessment Needs**

- Collect DATA and track student learning results for Mongolian institutions (such data did not exist).

- Determine the knowledge level of Mongolian students completing degree programs from the Mongolian institutions of higher education.

- Compare the Mongolian students’ performance levels between institutions and to those of other countries.

- **Assessment tool requirements:**
  - Comprehensive
  - Internationally accepted
  - A true third-party
  - In Mongolian language
Accreditation and Assessment

- MNCEA was looking for a third-party assessment tool to measure and track student learning results.

- 2010, with MNCEA’s assistance business schools in Mongolia began seeking US-based programmatic accreditation in Business education through ACBSP.

- Peregrine Academic Services, as a valued Partner of ACBSP, was chartered to provide its online assessment exam for evaluation and measurement of student learning results and academic performance.
Peregrine Assessment Exams

- Peregrine online direct assessment service, CPC-based COMP exams are:
  - Designed for program-level assessment
  - Based on the Common Professional Components within a discipline (Business in this case)
  - Fully meet the standards and requirements of programmatic accreditation (IACBE and ACBSP in this case)
  - 200 institutions of higher education located in 30 countries completed the assessment exam
  - Pre-test (inbound) and post-test (outbound) construct provides internal and external comparison results

- 2011, Peregrine assessment exam test banks were translated into the Mongolian language
Peregrine Assessment Services in Mongolia

- 2011-2012: Initial beta-testing in Mongolia
  - Institute of Finance and Economics and Ider Institute

- 2012-2013: Additional testing with more Mongolian institutions of higher education

- 2013-present: Ongoing testing with about 20 Mongolian institutions of higher education


Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report*

- 2011-2012 and 2012-2013 academic years, 15 academic institutions in Mongolia:
  - 2,943 Bachelor’s academic degree level assessment exams
    - 1,419 Inbound
    - 1,522 Outbound exams, were administered to 15 client institutions
  - 266 Master’s academic degree level exams
    - 146 Inbound and
    - 122 Outbound exams

- Cumulative averages are compared with other Outside US and US aggregate pools for strategic academic benchmarking and comparative analysis.

- Due to confidentiality agreements in place with the exam services, only summarized results are presented within this report.
Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report (cont.)*

Academic institutions included in the Report

1. “Etugen” Institute
2. “Ider” Institute
3. Institute of Finance and Economics
4. “Mandakh Burtgel” Institute
5. Mongolian National Institute
6. Mongolian State University of Agriculture, School of Economics and Business
7. Mongolian University of Science and Technology, Computer Science and Management School
8. National University of Mongolia, School of Economic Studies
9. “Otgontenger” Institute
10. “San” Institute
11. “Seruuleg” Institute
12. The Global Leadership University
13. The Institute of International Economics and Business
14. “Tsetsee Gun” Institute
15. University of the Humanities, Business School
Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report (cont.)*

Methodology

- **Initial assessment: Inbound Exam**
  - Students take the first CPC-based COMP exam early in their academic program, within their first business course.

- **Final assessment: Outbound Exam**
  - Students take the same exam at the end of their program, before graduation within their last business course.

- **In-program assessment: Mid-point Exam**
  - Occasionally, schools also administer the same exam during the program of study towards the middle of the program.
Peregrine Assessment: Mongolia Country Report (cont.)

12 Common Professional Component Topics

1. Accounting
2. Business Ethics
3. Business Finance
4. Business Integration and Strategic Management
5. Business Leadership
6. Economics
   - Macroeconomics
   - Microeconomics
7. Global Dimensions of Business
8. Information Management Systems
9. Legal Environment of Business
10. Management
    - Human Resource Management
    - Operations/Production Management
    - Organizational Behavior
11. Marketing
12. Quantitative Research Techniques and Statistics
Table 2. Outbound Exam results for Mongolian, Outside US, and US Bachelor’s level students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CPC Topic</th>
<th>Mongolia</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>Outside US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Assessment Analysis</td>
<td>45.8%</td>
<td>51.4%</td>
<td>46.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>43.1%</td>
<td>51.6%</td>
<td>41.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Ethics</td>
<td>52.4%</td>
<td>54.5%</td>
<td>54.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Finance</td>
<td>30.9%</td>
<td>49.7%</td>
<td>31.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Integration and Strategic Management</td>
<td>54.7%</td>
<td>48.3%</td>
<td>56.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Leadership</td>
<td>48.5%</td>
<td>51.3%</td>
<td>48.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>44.1%</td>
<td>48.1%</td>
<td>43.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomics</td>
<td>46.4%</td>
<td>47.8%</td>
<td>46.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microeconomics</td>
<td>41.8%</td>
<td>48.4%</td>
<td>41.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Dimensions of Business</td>
<td>53.7%</td>
<td>55.9%</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Management Systems</td>
<td>48.5%</td>
<td>63.9%</td>
<td>48.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Environment of Business</td>
<td>45.6%</td>
<td>58.3%</td>
<td>45.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>47.9%</td>
<td>55.2%</td>
<td>48.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
<td>60.2%</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
<td>59.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations/Production Management</td>
<td>34.4%</td>
<td>52.2%</td>
<td>36.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Behavior</td>
<td>49.1%</td>
<td>55.3%</td>
<td>47.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>41.0%</td>
<td>37.9%</td>
<td>42.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative Research Techniques and Statistics</td>
<td>46.4%</td>
<td>41.5%</td>
<td>47.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1. Bachelor’s academic degree level Outbound Exam results for Mongolia, US, and Outside US – TOTAL SCORE.

Total Outbound Exam Results Comparison:
Total - Bachelor's
Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report (cont.)*

Figure 19. Bachelor’s academic degree level Inbound to Outbound Exam Percentage Change results for Mongolia, US, and Outside US for the total exam scores.

**Inbound and Outbound Exam Results**
**Percentage Change Comparison:**
**Total - Bachelor's**

![Bar chart showing percentage change comparison between Inbound and Outbound exams for Bachelor's degree level. The chart compares Mongolia, US, and Outside US. The percentages are: 9.9% for Mongolia, 14.9% for US, and 12.6% for Outside US.](chart.png)
Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report (cont.)*

Table 4. Outbound Exam results for Mongolian, Outside US, and US Master’s level students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CPC Topic</th>
<th>Mongolia</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>Outside US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Assessment Analysis</td>
<td>50.4%</td>
<td>58.4%</td>
<td>52.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>58.9%</td>
<td>55.4%</td>
<td>57.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Ethics</td>
<td>40.8%</td>
<td>57.5%</td>
<td>60.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Finance</td>
<td>45.2%</td>
<td>42.6%</td>
<td>46.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Integration and Strategic Management</td>
<td>47.9%</td>
<td>66.8%</td>
<td>50.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Leadership</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
<td>71.1%</td>
<td>50.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>53.0%</td>
<td>52.7%</td>
<td>51.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomics</td>
<td>51.2%</td>
<td>51.0%</td>
<td>52.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microeconomics</td>
<td>54.9%</td>
<td>54.6%</td>
<td>65.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Dimensions of Business</td>
<td>47.2%</td>
<td>53.0%</td>
<td>51.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Management Systems</td>
<td>44.3%</td>
<td>64.9%</td>
<td>59.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Environment of Business</td>
<td>56.6%</td>
<td>55.6%</td>
<td>51.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>57.3%</td>
<td>62.7%</td>
<td>63.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
<td>49.4%</td>
<td>63.1%</td>
<td>57.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations/Production Management</td>
<td>66.5%</td>
<td>60.3%</td>
<td>47.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Behavior</td>
<td>55.7%</td>
<td>64.5%</td>
<td>53.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>43.8%</td>
<td>62.6%</td>
<td>48.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative Research Techniques and Statistics</td>
<td>44.6%</td>
<td>53.5%</td>
<td>44.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 20. Master’s academic degree level Outbound Exam results for Mongolia, US, and Outside US – **TOTAL SCORE**.

**Outbound Exam Results Comparison:**
**Total - Master's**
Peregrine Assessment: *Mongolia Country Report (cont.)*

Figure 38. Master’s academic degree level Inbound to Outbound Exam Percentage Change results for Mongolia, US, and Outside US for the total exam scores.

Inbound and Outbound Exam Results
Percentage Change Comparison:
Total - Master's
• Results show measurable change in student knowledge as a direct measure of the academic experience.

• Mongolian students’ results are comparable with counterparts at institutions of higher education located within the US and outside of the US, indicating a strong competitiveness of Mongolian students for work within the business industry.
Benefits of Student Learning Assessment in Mongolia

• Students
  – Were eager to take the internationally accepted and administered exam
  – Excited to receive information comparing their performance against those of other countries and the US
  – Got energized to perform better
  – Received assurance about the quality of education they are receiving at their institution

• Program
  – Helps to identify subject areas of weakness and strength
  – Helps to design and modify course content to better serve students
  – Assess success and failure of changes to the curriculum from consecutive testing
  – Improve program standards based on comparison of own program results against the local, international and the US benchmarks

• Institution
  – Data and tracking tool for student learning results
  – Identify where you are and decide which benchmark to set as a target
  – Program improvement
  – New program development
  – Faculty development projects
  – Promoting the institution and its message to stakeholders
Implications of Assessment

• 2012-2013: Two institutions of higher education in Mongolia received international accreditation from a US programmatic accrediting agency, ACBSP
  – Institute of Finance and Economics
  – National University of Mongolia, School of Economics and Business

• 2013-2014: One more institution, MUST-KTMS accredited by ACBSP

• More schools are using Peregrine Assessment services to improve the quality of their education and meet international accreditation requirements.
Further Application

• This model of improving the quality of education system through assessment of student learning results, with relation to international accreditation, has been very successful in the case of Mongolia.

• We believe that the model could be successfully applied to other countries.

• We have been expanding our services: the CPC-based COMP exam for Business Education is available in 6 different languages and administered in 30 countries.
Expanding Services in Mongolia

• **September 17-20, 2013: International Accreditation and Quality Assurance Workshop**
  – **Location:** Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
  – **Co-organizers:**
    • Ministry of Education and Science of Mongolia
    • Mongolian National Council on Education Accreditation
    • Peregrine Academic Services – Mongolia
  – **Presenters:** Bill Parrott and Alimaa Jamiyansuren of Peregrine Academic Services

• **Topics covered**
  – International Higher Education Accreditation
  – Comprehensive Quality Assessment
  – Strategic Planning
  – Accreditation Site Visit Team Leader Training
Expanding Services in Mongolia

Fall 2013: Consulting work with institutions of higher education

– Schools visited:
  • “Etugen” Institute
  • “San” Institute
  • “Mandakh” Burtgel Institute
  • MUST-KTMS
  • MSUA-School of Economics and Business

– Consultants: Bill Parrott and Alimaa Jamiyansuren of Peregrine Academic Services

Topics covered:

– International Accreditation Procedures
– Understanding International Accreditation Standards and Criteria
– Review of Strategic Plans, Self Study Reports and Processes
– Preparing for Site Visit Team and the Supporting Documents
Thank you!
Valued Partner for Academic Preparedness

Peregrine Academic Services
Box 741
1001 S. Douglas Hwy, Suite #160
Gillette WY 82717
Phone: (307) 685-1555
Fax: (307) 685-0141
Toll Free: 1-877-260-1555
Info@PeregrineAcademics.com